

From: McDermid, Ian
Sent: Wednesday, 3 August 2011 7:13 PM
To: Elections
Subject: Further objection to the second proposed 2011 redistribution
Attachments: Copy of Current_and_projected_stats_.xls

Dear Mr Green,

I am a resident of Turner and a enrolled voter, up until now in the Molonglo division. I work at the ANU, but the following are my own private views.

Having read the "Statement by the Augmented Electoral Commission", I agree with the statements towards the end of page 14 and the views of the Turner Resident's Association expressed at the top of page 15 of that document. As an inner-city resident of a long established suburb, who walks, cycles or uses public transport and rarely uses my private motor vehicle; on community and electoral issues, I definitely feel a closer affinity to other residents of the North Canberra area, than I do with residents of Belconnen and Gungahlin (even though other members of my family live in Belconnen).

I also feel that the Augmented Commission were a little hasty in dismissing Mr Reynolds' alternative suggestion, mentioned on page 11. Some quick calculations using your spreadsheet (copy attached – the only changes are on Table 1 and a new pivot table) suggest that a 5 seat Molonglo electorate consisting of all of North Canberra, South Canberra and Woden Valley; a 5 seat Brindabella electorate consisting of all of Tuggeranong and all of the southern ACT located west of Tuggeranong Parkway and south of Hindmarsh Drive, Bulger Creek and the Murrumbidgee River (which includes the Weston Creek suburbs of Chapman, Fisher, Rivett, Stirling and Waramanga); and a 7 seat Ginninderra electorate consisting of all of Gungahlin, Hall, Belconnen, the Molonglo Valley, Stromlo and the northern Weston Creek suburbs of Duffy, Holder and Weston would have the following profiles:

<<Copy of Current_and_projected_stats_.xls>>

Alternative Proposal	Number of Members	Approx. Enrolment 2011	Projected Enrolment Oct 2012	% above or below quota 2012
Brindabella	5	74137	74909	-0.58%
Ginninderra	7	98117	103373	-2.00%
Molonglo	5	75661	77886	+3.38%

I feel this proposal has the following advantages:

1. It keeps all but one of Canberra's regional "townships" in a single electorate, i.e. under this proposal, none of Gungahlin, Belconnen, North Canberra, South Canberra, Woden Valley, Tuggeranong or Molonglo Valley are split between electorates, only Weston Creek.
2. It provides for future growth better than the proposal currently favoured by the Augmented Commission (refer page 2). Even without Molonglo Valley, the above proposed electorate of Molonglo does have some potential for growth with urban "in-fill" in older suburbs; new unit developments in Civic, Braddon and other areas of the inner North such as my own suburb of Turner, and townhouse developments such as those in northern Watson. I also argue that this

growth is decidedly different in character to the “green-fields” suburban growth in Gungahlin and Molonglo Valley and therefore will attract new residents with different electoral interests. Even with this new growth, Molonglo’s future growth will be small relative to the rest of the ACT and the % over-quota will gradually diminish with time. Under both proposals, the electorate of Brindabella is under-quota and has no obvious new growth areas; but under the above proposal, an obvious way to address this in future redistributions, would be to transfer the northern Weston Creek suburbs (and even later the Molonglo Valley) from the high growth Ginninderra electorate to the low growth Brindabella electorate, eventually re-uniting Weston Creek in a single electorate.

3. All of the percentages under or over quota in this proposal are less than the –3.49% under-quota that the Brindabella electorate will be under the proposal currently favoured by the Augmented Commission. Under that proposal and under the current electoral system, the only way that this under-quota percentage can be readily be addressed in future redistributions is by carving off even more suburbs in the southern Woden Valley to move from the Molonglo to the Brindabella electorate. To compensate for this, future redistributions will probably have to return Turner, then O’Connor and finally Lyneham from the high growth Ginninderra electorate to the Molonglo electorate.

The obvious disadvantage of this proposal is that it does (temporarily) split Weston Creek between two electorates, which is contrary to current and historical objections, effectively isolating the suburbs of Duffy, Holder and Weston from the remainder of their community. However, I feel it is probably better to temporarily inconvenience the (projected) 6,680 residents of these three suburbs, rather than the (projected) 7,855 residents of the Woden Valley suburbs of Chifley, Farrer, Pearce and Torrens AND the (projected) 9,928 residents of the North Canberra suburbs of Lyneham, O’Connor and Turner (including me).

Regards, Ian

=====
 Ian McDermid
 Lecturer in Statistics
 School of Finance, Actuarial Studies and Applied Statistics
 College of Business and Economics
 Room 3.08, ANU CBE Building [26C]
 The Australian National University
 Canberra ACT 0200 Australia

Pivot table

			Data	
Proposal2	SSD	Suburb	Sum of Actual	Sum of Projected
Brindabella			74137	74909
Ginninderra			98117	103373
Molonglo			75661	77886
Grand Total			247915	256168

Current and Projected Numbers of Persons Enrolled

Table 1: Australian Capital Territory

	Actual persons enrolled	Projected persons enrolled	% change	Present electorate	Proposed new electorate	Alternative new proposal	SSD
Suburb	30-Sep-10	20-Oct-12					
Suburb	Actual	Projected	Change	Present	Proposed	Proposal2	SSD
Acton	360	368	2.22%	Molonglo	Molonglo	Molonglo	North Canberra
Ainslie	3864	3973	2.82%	Molonglo	Molonglo	Molonglo	North Canberra
Amaroo	3563	3688	3.51%	Molonglo	Ginninderra	Ginninderra	Gungahlin-Hall
Aranda	1842	1836	-0.33%	Ginninderra	Ginninderra	Ginninderra	Belconnen
Banks	3370	3951	17.24%	Brindabella	Brindabella	Brindabella	Tuggeranong
Barton	827	928	12.21%	Molonglo	Molonglo	Molonglo	South Canberra
Belconnen Town Centre	2386	2843	19.15%	Ginninderra	Ginninderra	Ginninderra	Belconnen
Belconnen - SSD Bal	32	34	6.25%	Ginninderra	Ginninderra	Ginninderra	Belconnen
Bonner	129	523	305.43%	Molonglo	Ginninderra	Ginninderra	Gungahlin-Hall
Bonython	2663	2831	6.31%	Brindabella	Brindabella	Brindabella	Tuggeranong
Braddon	2770	3157	13.97%	Molonglo	Molonglo	Molonglo	North Canberra
Bruce	3044	3659	20.20%	Ginninderra	Ginninderra	Ginninderra	Belconnen
Calwell	4225	4402	4.19%	Brindabella	Brindabella	Brindabella	Tuggeranong
Campbell / Duntroon / Majura	3923	3943	0.51%	Molonglo	Molonglo	Molonglo	North Canberra
Casey	229	723	215.72%	Molonglo	Ginninderra	Ginninderra	Gungahlin-Hall
Chapman	2201	2087	-5.18%	Molonglo	Molonglo	Brindabella	Weston Creek-Stromlo
Charnwood	2123	2052	-3.34%	Ginninderra	Ginninderra	Ginninderra	Belconnen
Chifley	1720	1764	2.56%	Brindabella	Brindabella	Molonglo	Woden Valley
Chisholm	3873	3709	-4.23%	Brindabella	Brindabella	Brindabella	Tuggeranong
City	864	1060	22.69%	Molonglo	Molonglo	Molonglo	North Canberra
Conder	3501	4084	16.65%	Brindabella	Brindabella	Brindabella	Tuggeranong
Cook	2181	2180	-0.05%	Ginninderra	Ginninderra	Ginninderra	Belconnen
Crace	32	112	250.00%	Molonglo	Ginninderra	Ginninderra	Gungahlin-Hall
Curtin	3958	3975	0.43%	Molonglo	Molonglo	Molonglo	Woden Valley
Deakin	2110	2127	0.81%	Molonglo	Molonglo	Molonglo	South Canberra
Dickson	1432	1482	3.49%	Molonglo	Molonglo	Molonglo	North Canberra
Downer	2468	2498	1.22%	Molonglo	Molonglo	Molonglo	North Canberra
Duffy	2390	2260	-5.44%	Molonglo	Molonglo	Ginninderra	Weston Creek-Stromlo
Dunlop	4450	5218	17.26%	Ginninderra	Ginninderra	Ginninderra	Belconnen
Evatt	4058	3865	-4.76%	Ginninderra	Ginninderra	Ginninderra	Belconnen
Fadden	2489	2323	-6.67%	Brindabella	Brindabella	Brindabella	Tuggeranong
Farrer	2579	2489	-3.49%	Brindabella	Brindabella	Molonglo	Woden Valley
Fisher	2355	2314	-1.74%	Molonglo	Molonglo	Brindabella	Weston Creek-Stromlo
Florey	3606	3656	1.39%	Ginninderra	Ginninderra	Ginninderra	Belconnen
Flynn	2624	2458	-6.33%	Ginninderra	Ginninderra	Ginninderra	Belconnen
Forde	633	862	36.18%	Molonglo	Ginninderra	Ginninderra	Gungahlin-Hall
Forrest	1142	1156	1.23%	Molonglo	Molonglo	Molonglo	South Canberra
Franklin	1189	2961	149.03%	Molonglo	Ginninderra	Ginninderra	Gungahlin-Hall
Fraser	1637	1541	-5.86%	Ginninderra	Ginninderra	Ginninderra	Belconnen
Fyshwick	24	21	-12.50%	Molonglo	Molonglo	Molonglo	South Canberra
Garran	2317	2342	1.08%	Molonglo	Molonglo	Molonglo	Woden Valley
Gilmore	2004	1964	-2.00%	Brindabella	Brindabella	Brindabella	Tuggeranong
Giralang	2594	2425	-6.52%	Ginninderra	Ginninderra	Ginninderra	Belconnen
Gordon	5450	6193	13.63%	Brindabella	Brindabella	Brindabella	Tuggeranong
Gowrie	2482	2371	-4.47%	Brindabella	Brindabella	Brindabella	Tuggeranong
Greenway	1088	1199	10.20%	Brindabella	Brindabella	Brindabella	Tuggeranong
Griffith	3172	3306	4.22%	Molonglo	Molonglo	Molonglo	South Canberra
Gungahlin	3120	3513	12.60%	Molonglo	Ginninderra	Ginninderra	Gungahlin-Hall
Gungahlin-Hall - SSD Bal	16	16	0.00%	Molonglo	Ginninderra	Ginninderra	Gungahlin-Hall
Hackett	2265	2299	1.50%	Molonglo	Molonglo	Molonglo	North Canberra
Hall	235	228	-2.98%	Ginninderra	Ginninderra	Ginninderra	Gungahlin-Hall
Harman	41	38	-7.32%	Molonglo	Molonglo	Molonglo	South Canberra
Harrison	2462	2790	13.32%	Molonglo	Ginninderra	Ginninderra	Gungahlin-Hall
Hawker	2199	2102	-4.41%	Ginninderra	Ginninderra	Ginninderra	Belconnen
Higgins	2260	2137	-5.44%	Ginninderra	Ginninderra	Ginninderra	Belconnen
Holder	2077	1978	-4.77%	Molonglo	Molonglo	Ginninderra	Weston Creek-Stromlo
Holt	3506	3602	2.74%	Ginninderra	Ginninderra	Ginninderra	Belconnen
Hughes	2163	2196	1.53%	Molonglo	Molonglo	Molonglo	Woden Valley
Hume	7	7	0.00%	Molonglo	Molonglo	Molonglo	South Canberra
Isaacs	1903	1948	2.36%	Molonglo	Molonglo	Molonglo	Woden Valley
Isabella Plains	2988	3008	0.67%	Brindabella	Brindabella	Brindabella	Tuggeranong
Jerrabomberra	8	9	0.00%	Molonglo	Molonglo	Molonglo	South Canberra
Kaleen	5701	5330	-6.51%	Ginninderra	Ginninderra	Ginninderra	Belconnen
Kambah	11752	11101	-5.54%	Brindabella	Brindabella	Brindabella	Tuggeranong
Kingston	2179	2368	8.67%	Molonglo	Molonglo	Molonglo	South Canberra
Kowen	25	26	4.00%	Molonglo	Molonglo	Molonglo	North Canberra
Latham	2775	2630	-5.23%	Ginninderra	Ginninderra	Ginninderra	Belconnen